EPA-600/R-02/021
January 2002

Costs of Urban Stormwater Control

By

James P. Heaney
David Sample and Leonard Wright
University of Colorado
Boulder, CO 80309

Contract No. 68-C7-0011

Project Officer

Chi-Yuan Fan
Water Supply and Water Resources Division
National Risk Management Research Laboratory
Edison, NJ 08837

NATIONAL RISK MANAGEMENT RESEARCH LABORATORY
OFFICE OF RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT
U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY
CINCINNATI, OH 45268

Notice

The information in this document has been funded by the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) under Contract No. 68-C7-0011 to Science Applications International Corporation (SAIC) and its consultant. It has been subjected to the Agency's peer and administrative review and has been approved for publication as an EPA document.

Foreword

The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency is charged by Congress with protecting the Nation's land, air, and water resources. Under a mandate of national environmental laws, the Agency strives to formulate and implement actions leading to a compatible balance between human activities and the ability of natural systems to support and nurture life. To meet this mandate, EPA's research program is providing data and technical support for solving environmental problems today and building a science knowledge base necessary to manage our ecological resources wisely, understand how pollutants affect our health, and prevent or reduce environmental risks in the future.

The National Risk Management Research Laboratory (NRMRL) is the Agency's center for investigation of technological and management approaches for preventing and reducing risks from pollution that threatens human health and the environment. The focus of the Laboratory's research program is on methods and their cost-effectiveness for prevention and control of pollution to air, land, water, and subsurface resources; protection of water quality in public water systems; remediation of contaminated sites, sediments and ground water; prevention and control of indoor air pollution; and restoration of ecosystems. NRMRL collaborates with both public and private sector partners to foster technologies that reduce the cost of compliance and to anticipate emerging problems. NRMRL research provides solutions to environmental problems by: developing and promoting technologies that protect and improve the environment; advancing scientific and engineering information to support regulatory and policy decisions; and providing the technical support and information transfer to ensure implementation of environmental regulations and strategies at the national, state, and community levels.

This publication has been produced as part of the Laboratory's strategic long-term research plan. It is published and made available by EPA's Office of Research and Development to assist the user community and to link researchers with their clients.

E. Timothy Oppelt, Director
National Risk Management Research
Laboratory

Abstract

This report presents information on the cost of stormwater pollution control facilities in urban areas, including collection, control, and treatment systems. Information on prior cost studies of control technologies and cost estimating models used in these studies was collected, reviewed, and evaluated. The collection phase involved identifying, screening, and consolidating publications associated with capital costs of stormwater conveyance systems and control technologies. The resulting data were evaluated to develop a critical review of costs for urban stormwater control technologies, including identification of cost information gaps and research needs.

Contents

Foreword iii
Abstract iv
Figures vii
Tables viii
Acknowledgment x

Chapter 1 Introduction 1

Chapter 2 Cost Estimation Methods-Literature Review 2
2.1 Forms of the Cost Equations 2
2.1.1 Single explanatory variable 2
2.1.2 Multiple explanatory variables 2
2.2 Pipe Costs 3
2.3 Manholes 6
2.4 Other Sewer Pipe Related Costs 7
2.5 Storage Costs 7
2.6 Multipurpose Facilities 7
2.7 Integrated Approaches 8
2.8 Process-Oriented Approaches 9
2.9 Stormwater Cost Optimization 9
2.10 Summary and Conclusions 11

Chapter 3 Cost Estimates for Stormwater Systems 12
3.1 Stormwater Pipelines 12
3.1.1 Pipeline installation 12
3.1.2 Trench excavation costs 14
3.1.3 Bedding costs 15
3.2 Manholes 17
3.3 Open Channels 19
3.4 Pump Stations 19
3.5 Pavement and Creation of Impervious Surfaces 19
3.6 Conclusions 21

Chapter 4 Cost Effectiveness of Stormwater Quality Controls 22
4.1 Objectives of Control 22
4.2 Control Descriptions and Construction Costs 22
4.2.1 Offline storage-release systems 22
4.2.2 Swirl concentrators 23
4.2.3 Screens 24
4.2.4 Sedimentation basins 25
4.2.5 Disinfection 25
4.2.6 Best management practices 25
4.3 Operation and Maintenance Costs for Controls 33

Chapter 5 Process-Level Cost Estimation....35
5.1 Case Study....35
5.1.1 Calculate the design flows into the drainage system....35
5.1.2 Sizing the sewer pipes and their slopes....45
5.1.3 Sewer system cost evaluation....48
5.2 Scenario Analysis....50
5.2.1 Management of the demand for imperviousness....52
5.2.2 Management of land use....52
5.2.3 Effect of recurrence interval....53
5.2.4 Effect of climate....53
5.2.5 Effect of assumed minimum inlet flow time....53
5.2.6 Required minimum depth of cover....53
5.2.7 Effect of pipe material....54
5.2.8 Possible number of scenarios....54
5.3 Results for the Selected Scenarios....56
5.4 Effect of Uncertainty in the Estimates....57
5.5 Summary and Conclusions on Scenarios....59

Chapter 6 Cost-Effectiveness of Alternative Micro-storm Management Options....63
6.1 Introduction....63
6.2 Literature Review....64
6.2.1 Land use/control options....64
6.2.2 Hydrology in SLAMM....67
6.2.3 NRCS method and initial abstraction....67
6.2.4 Costs of controls in Pitt's work....67
6.2.5 Control devices in SLAMM....69
6.2.6 Limitations of SLAMM....69
6.2.7 Low impact development....69
6.3 Proposed Approach....69
6.3.1 Introduction....69
6.3.2 Hydrologically functional landscaping....70
6.3.3 Cost of CN modifications....70
6.3.4 Land valuation....70
6.4 Hypothetical Study Area....77
6.4.1 Study area attributes....78
6.4.2 Unit costs....80
6.4.3 Summary of costs for each parcel....90
6.4.4 Summary of costs for each right-of-way....98
6.5 Estimated cost of BMP controls....98
6.5.1 Determination of runoff volumes using SCS method....99
6.5.2 Breakdown of calculated volumes per function....99
6.5.3 Estimated unit costs of various functional land use options....102
6.6 Results of BMP Optimization for Happy Acres....105

Chapter 7 Summary and Conclusions....106

References....108

Figures

2-1. Profile view of the vertical alignment of a stormwater system 10
2-2. Layout of the 20 pipe stormwater problem 11
3-1. Cost of storm drainage pipe. 14
3-2. Trench excavation costs. 15
3-3. Manhole costs, as a function of excavation depth 18
4-1. Construction costs, off-line storage. 23
4-2. Construction costs for swirl concentrators, screens, sedimentation basins, and disinfection. 24
4-3. Construction cost, detention and retention basins, and off-line surface units. 27
4-4. Construction cost, infiltration trenches and basins. 29
4-5. Operation and maintenance costs for CSO controls 34
5-1. Study area topography 36
5-2. Study area sewer network 37
5-3. Study area land use 39
5-4. Intensity-duration-frequency curves for Boulder, CO 42
5-5. Intensity-duration-frequency curves for Houston, TX 42
5-6. Intensities vs. recurrence interval for Boulder, CO and Houston, TX for a 20-min duration 43
5-7. Results of the five design scenarios. 58
5-8. Cumulative total cost distribution. 60
5-9. Tornado plot of uncertainty in scenario. 61
6-1. Illustrative rainfall-runoff relationship 68
6-2. Conventional storm drainage 71
6-3. Illustration of hydrologically functional landscape 72
6-4. Study area GIS. 78
6-5. Study area soils. 79
6-6. Allocation of available storage for initial abstraction and land use. 102

Tables

2-1. Average Non-Pipe Costs as Percent of Total In-Place Pipe Costs for Sanitary Sewers 7
2-2. Estimated Capital Cost of Storage as a Function of Volume. 8
3-1. Lookup Table for Corrugated Metal Pipe....13
3-2. Lookup Table for Reinforced Concrete Pipe....13
3-3. Trench Excavation Costs, (Includes Backfill and Blasting)....14
3-4. Bedding Costs....16
3-5. Precast Concrete Manholes Costs....18
3-6. Capital Costs of Sewage Pump Stations....19
3-7. Paving Costs 20
4-1. BMP Pollutant Removal Ranges 32
4-2. An Assessment of Design Robustness Technology for Several BMPs....33
5-1. Sewer Network Design Hydrology....38
5-2. Mix of Land Uses in Happy Acres 40
5-3. Imperviousness for Various Land Uses....40
5-4. Runoff Coefficients for Various Areas....41
5-5. Comparison of Design Rainfall Intensities for 20-Minute Duration Storms in Boulder, CO 43
5-6. IDF Curve Parameters for Boulder, CO 44
5-7. Sewer Network Design Hydraulics 46
5-8. Sewer Network Design Cost....47
5-9. Lookup Table for Corrugated Metal Pipe....48
5-10. Lookup Table for Reinforced Concrete Pipe....49
5-11. Excavation Costs 49
5-12. Bedding Costs....51
5-13. Summary of Cost Scenarios 56
6-1. Source Areas in SLAMM 65
6-2. Other Information Needed in a Source Area 65
6-3. Sample SLAMM Output for Toronto, ON, Canada 66
6-4. Initial Abstraction as a Function of Curve Numbers (CN)....70
6-5. Breakdown of the Cost of a Typical House....75
6-6. Breakdown of the Cost of Housing in 1984 and 1988 75
6-7. Estimated Housing Costs....76
6-8. Right-of-Way Characteristics 79
6-9. Lot Characteristics for Residential Parcels....79
6-10. Aggregate Characteristics for Commercial, Apartments, and Schools 80
6-11. Land Valuation for Medium Density Lot 80
6-12. Cost Analysis of Landscaping for Medium Density Lot 82
6-13. Land Valuation for Low Density Lot 83
6-14. Cost Analysis of Landscaping for Low Density Lot 83
6-15. Land Valuation for Commercial Areas 84
6-16. Cost Analysis of Landscaping for Commercial Areas 84
6-17. Land Valuation for Apartments....85

6-18. Cost Analysis of Landscaping for Apartments 85
6-19. Land Valuation for Schools 86
6-20. Cost Analysis of Landscaping for Schools 86
6-21. Costs of Pavement, Curb and Gutter, and Sidewalks 87
6-22. Cost Analysis for 50 ft Right-Of-Way 88
6-23. Cost Analysis for 60 ft Right-Of-Way 88
6-24. Cost Analysis for 70 ft Right-Of-Way 89
6-25. Cost Analysis for Parking 89
6-26. Cost Analysis for Sidewalks and Patios 90
6-27. Cost Analysis for Driveways 90
6-28. Parcel Development Costs 91
6-29. Right-of-Way Costs 98
6-30. SCS Hydrologic Classifications, and Calculation of Unit Storage Values 100
6-31. Calculation of Developed and Predevelopment Stormwater Volumes 101
6-32. Calculation of Unit Costs for Controls, Including Land Opportunity Costs 103
6-33. Calculation of Unit Costs for Controls, Excluding Land Opportunity Costs 104
6-34. Range of Costs for Storage 105

Acknowledgments

This report was prepared for the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) Office of Research and Development by Science Applications International Corporation and its consultant under EPA Contract No. 68-C7-0011. The project was sponsored by the National Risk Management Research Laboratory Environmental Engineering Economics Program.